Exclusive Imaginings: Nationalism and Indigenous Women in Chile and Peru

Rebekah Stewart
Occidental College

Follow this and additional works at: http://scholar.oxy.edu/dwa_student

Part of the Feminist, Gender, and Sexuality Studies Commons, and the Latin American Studies Commons

Recommended Citation

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Diplomacy and World Affairs at OxyScholar. It has been accepted for inclusion in DWA Student Scholarship by an authorized administrator of OxyScholar. For more information, please contact cdla@oxy.edu.
Exclusive Imaginings:
Nationalism and Indigenous Women in Chile and Peru

By Rebekah Stewart
Occidental College

Diplomacy and World Affairs Senior Comprehensive Thesis
Spring 2011
Supervised by Professor Movindri Reddy
# Table of Contents

**Introduction** .......................................................................................................................... 2

**Theories of Nationalism and the Nation in Latin America** ...................................................... 4

  Nationalism Theory and the Origins of the Nation ........................................................................ 4

  The Study of Nationalism in Latin America .................................................................................. 14

**Nationalism and Indigenous Women: Chile and Peru in Comparative Perspective** .......... 18

  Indigenous Women and the Construction of National Identities in the Post-Colonial Period ..... 18

  Contemporary Nationalism and the State: An examination of the governments of Chile and Peru................................................................................................................................. 26

**Conclusion: Indigenous women and the challenge of expanding national identities** .......... 43

**Works Cited** ............................................................................................................................. 46
**Introduction**

Many theorists have contended that nationalism is based on notions of exclusion and the idea of an "other" that exists outside of the nation. Perceptions of gender and racial identity greatly contribute to the way in which the nation is imagined in Andean South America, and this paper analyzes how indigenous women have been affected by the national discourses that have formed in Chile and Peru. I argue that although there has been increasing recognition at the global level of the need to expand national ideologies to include formerly marginalized groups, indigenous women in Peru and Chile continue to be prevented from participating fully as rights-holders and citizens of the state because they are marginalized by the dominant national discourses in terms of belonging and representation. In Chile, Mapuche women are left out of imaginings of the nation not only because of their status as indigenous, but also because of their gender and socioeconomic position. Chile's neighbor to the north, Peru, has also relied upon sentiments of nationalism that maintain a strict social hierarchy and relegate indigenous women to the margins of society. Despite the fact that Peru has a larger indigenous population than does Chile, the ruling elite of Peru have constructed a national community that views Quechua women as subservient due to their indigeneity, gender, and class.

This paper examines the experiences of indigenous women living in the states of Chile and Peru. I focus mainly on Mapuche women in Chile and Quechua women in Peru, as these are the largest indigenous groups in both countries. In my analysis, I illustrate the problems that arise as a result of hegemonic understandings of the nation and the complexities associated with

---

national identity in Latin America. The paper is organized into three sections. The first is an examination of nationalism theory and how it can be applied to the study of national imaginings in Latin America. In the second section, I illustrate the exclusionary nature of nationalism in Chile and Peru through a comparative examination of the ways in which conceptions of the nation have contributed to discrimination against indigenous women. I utilize a modernist theoretical framework in my case study, contending that the Chilean and Peruvian nations are not based on primordial ties to a homeland, but rather on constructed sentiments of community that have been disseminated by elites in both countries. The third and final section, the conclusion, discusses the future of national identity in these two countries with respect to indigenous women as well as the importance of recognizing the way in which national ideologies play a part in the exclusion of indigenous women in Latin America.

While there are many societal factors that further the marginalization of indigenous women from the dominant national communities in these two countries, I chose to concentrate primarily on the role of the Chilean and Peruvian states in my comparative case study. Specifically, I evaluate the creation of national discourses that excluded indigenous women during the post-colonial period as well as how the contemporary states of Chile and Peru have reflected these hegemonic sentiments of nationalism in their policies and practices. In comparing the national trajectories of these countries, I illustrate the challenges faced by indigenous women in Andean South America because they do not conform to ideas of who belongs to the nation. A demonstrated commitment on the part of the Chilean and Peruvian states is needed in order to resist the influences of hegemonic forms of nationalism and to combat the discrimination against indigenous women that is still prevalent today in both countries.
Theories of nationalism and the nation in Latin America

Nationalism Theory and the Origins of the Nation

Much of nationalism theory was born out of analyses of the rise and fall of the Soviet Union and what Micheline Ishay refers to as the “eruption of nationalism” that occurred in former soviet bloc countries after the Cold War. Although the literature on nationalism has increased significantly in the past fifty years, contemporary scholars do not agree on a definition of nationalism. At the forefront of the debate on the origins of nationalism are those who belong to more primordial or “perennial” schools of thought, such as John Armstrong and Anthony Smith, and those who subscribe to modernist or constructivist theories such as Ernest Gellner, Benedict Anderson, and John Breuilly. A primordial approach to the examination of nationalism ties nationalist ideologies to ancient times, while the modernist methodology generally attributes the rise of the phenomenon of nationalism to the formation of modern states that began in the sixteenth century in Europe. Because of the early development of the modern European state, the majority of nationalism literature has focused on Europe and has attributed “Third-World nationalism” to European colonial influence. This paper illustrates the importance of examining national allegiances in regions that have been neglected in the study of nationalism, such as Latin America, in order to gain a more comprehensive understanding of nationalist movements.

---

3 Ibid.
5 Ibid, 11.
6 Ishay, 2.
John Armstrong has been identified as belonging to the school of thought that “traces national loyalty to antiquity.”\(^7\) In his work *Nations Before Nationalism*, Armstrong describes nationalism as a phenomena rooted in ethnic identity. Armstrong bases his examination of ethnicity and the formation of nations on anthropologist Frederik Barth’s analysis of boundaries. Armstrong explains that “ethnicity is defined by boundaries”\(^8\) and those boundaries are not solely territorial in nature, but also based on the idea of “strangers”\(^9\) who exist outside the boundary of an ethnic group. Armstrong maintains that ethnic and cultural identities, which are to a certain degree inherent and static, serve to distinguish a group from those outside its boundaries. Nations, Armstrong contends, have arisen from this notion of exclusion that has defined group identities for centuries.\(^10\) Armstrong's primordialist assertions apply to the case of indigenous women in Chile and Peru, as both the Chilean and Peruvian nationalist discourses have relied on notions of ethnic identity and boundaries. However, Armstrong's theories do not take into account the modern and constructed elements of nationalism in Chile and Peru. Once Chile and Peru gained independence from Spain and became modern states, the newly formed state governments contributed to the construction of a national ideology that was not based on who actually originated from the land encompassed in the state's borders, but rather on who belonged to an elite class of men of European descent.

Anthony Smith has expanded upon Armstrong’s theory of group identity that evolves to become the nation. In *The Ethnic Origins of Nations*, Smith recognizes Armstrong’s work as critical to the study of nations and nationalism because it challenges the modernist idea of “the

\(^7\) Ishay, 1.
\(^9\) Ibid, 5.
\(^10\) Ibid.
nation as a wholly modern creation with few, if any, roots in earlier epochs.”\textsuperscript{11} Smith explains that the modernist view is problematic because “we find in pre-modern eras, even in the ancient world, striking parallels to the ‘modern’ idea of national identity and character.”\textsuperscript{12} He cites various examples of this pre-modern behavior, including Greek and Roman attitudes towards those from outside their city-states. In his discussion of the debate on the origins of the nation, Smith describes the emergence of the “perennialist” view of nationalism, which can be described as less “radical” than primordialism.\textsuperscript{13} Smith explains that perennialism acknowledges the importance of ancient group identities in the formation of nations without assuming that these group bonds are “universal” or “natural.”\textsuperscript{14} He asserts that the modernist position should be revised to take into account his belief that “in order to forge a ‘nation’ today, it is vital to create and crystallize ethnic components.”\textsuperscript{15} Ethnic roots, Smith argues, have played a critical role in the creation of national identities. According to Smith's perennialist thesis, a society's dominant national discourse should be that of a group that claims to have pre-modern ethnic ties to a territory. However, this is not the case in Chile and Peru. The fact that sentiments of Chilean and Peruvian nationalism are based not on who is indigenous to this region or on ethnic links to the homeland but on socially-constructed ideas of race and gender that were utilized by the "white" upper class in order to gain political control demonstrates the problems associated with Smith's assertions about the origins of the nation. As Appelbaum, Macpherson, and Rosemblatt explain in their discussion of constructed notions of race and Latin American nations, "elites advocated a process of cultural homogenization that, given prevalent cultural definitions of race, implied

\textsuperscript{11} Smith, 1.
\textsuperscript{12} Ibid, 11.
\textsuperscript{13} Ibid 12.
\textsuperscript{14} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{15} Ibid, 17.
racial whitening" and forced people of indigenous descent to reject their ethnic identity in order to belong to these hegemonic national communities.\textsuperscript{16}

Ernest Gellner disagrees with the primordialist view and is a modernist with respect to the study of nationalism. For him, nationalism is not an ancient and in-born phenomenon, but rather an ideology that was developed and disseminated upon the formation of the modern state.\textsuperscript{17} Gellner depicts nationalism as “primarily a political principle, which holds that the political and the national unit should be congruent.”\textsuperscript{18} He represents the modernist viewpoint because he attributes the movement from an agrarian society to an industrial society as vital to the formation of the nation and ties the rise of the modern, centralized state to the invention of the nation. While Gellner identifies a connection between the rise of the state and the rise of the nation, he also recognizes that they are two separate concepts. The state, Gellner explains, is sovereign with physically delineated borders, and the nation is a political invention that is not always defined by the boundaries of states. Gellner provides a clear distinction between the state and the nation that is illustrated in the way in which indigenous women in both Chile and Peru have not been included in ideas of the Chilean and Peruvian nations although they live within these respective states. Gellner asserts that “some nations have certainly emerged without the blessings of their own state,” and this is seen in the case of the Mapuche in Chile who have created their own Mapuche national identity because they are excluded from the constructed Chilean nation.\textsuperscript{19} Ultimately, Gellner concludes that nationalism calls for the constructed

\textsuperscript{17} Smith, 10.
\textsuperscript{19} Ibid, 6.
community of the nation and the political entity of the state to merge so that a government’s political agenda will reflect a certain national identity.

Like Gellner, Benedict Anderson identifies the construction of the nation as a modern occurrence, but he takes issue with Gellner's assertion that the nation should be understood primarily as a falsified political invention. According to Anderson, “communities are to be distinguished, not by their falsity/genuineness, but by the style in which they are imagined.”"^20 Anderson's definition of the nation has been a critical contribution to the study of nationalism that has greatly influenced the way in which nations are understood. The nation, Anderson explains, “is an imagined political community—and imagined as both inherently limited and sovereign.”"^21 According to Anderson, the nation is conceived as limited because national identities depend on boundaries. He identifies an important relationship between the nation and the state, because although they are not the same thing, the nation does rely on the notion of borders and boundaries. Anderson’s analysis of the limited nature of the nation relates to Barth’s and Armstrong’s, as it identifies exclusion and difference from those outside the nation as important in developing a national identity. Anderson refers to the nation as imagined as a community because its members feel connected to one another despite the fact that most of them will never meet each other. He describes this connection as “a deep, horizontal comradeship” that has inspired people to both kill and die for their nations."^22 Anderson continues to examine the cultural origins of the modern nation and categorizes nationalism as a contemporary movement that has resulted from the creation of the modern nation. His definition of the nation as a limited, imagined community serves as the basis for my examination of the extent to which

^20 Anderson, 6.
^21 Ibid.
^22 Ibid, 7.
indigenous women are excluded from the nation in Latin America, and it will be utilized throughout this paper.

In his analysis of the rise of modern nations, Anderson identifies “print-capitalism” as an important contributor to the formation of national identities.\(^{23}\) The rise of the novel and the newspaper connected the members of the national community culturally and allowed events to be placed in time. According to Anderson, these widely accessible writings made it possible to “‘think’ the nation” and spread a sense of belonging to an imagined community.\(^{24}\) Feminist scholars have explained that Anderson's discussion of print capitalism applies to the gendered national discourses that were created following the independence movement in Latin America due to the significant difference in literacy rates between men and women during this time. Because they were written and consumed largely by men of the elite class, publications in post-colonial Latin America were able to disseminate a perception of the nation that excluded women as well as rural and indigenous peoples.\(^{25}\) Anderson’s analysis of modern occurrences such as print capitalism that allowed for the creation of the nation and the rise of nationalism illustrates the scholarly view that nationalism is inherently modern. The nation, according to Anderson, is not a static and rigid concept, but a community that continues to be re-imagined and transformed. The modernist view of nationalism can be effectively applied to the case of indigenous women in Chile and Peru, as national identity is continuously contested in these states. The extent to which indigenous women will be included in future national conceptions in Chile and Peru remains to be seen, and this paper seeks to examine the potential for the extension of national citizenship to marginalized indigenous women.

\(^{23}\) Anderson, 36.
\(^{24}\) Ibid, 22.
John Breuilly examines nationalism as an essential element of modern political history in his work *Nationalism and the State*. Breuilly elucidates a modernist view that differs from that of Gellner or Anderson because it concentrates primarily on tracing the state’s role in promoting nationalism throughout history. Breuilly argues that before examining the “cultural, social, economic or psychological” nature of nationalism, as other nationalism theorists have done, it is necessary to analyze how nationalism as a “form of politics” has functioned in history.\(^2\) Breuilly states that nationalism literature lacks analyses of nationalism as inherently political, and he seeks to examine the specific political contexts of nationalism through comparative case studies. Because political movements vary between states, Breuilly advocates a more state-focused approach to the study of nationalism. Central to Breuilly’s thesis is the idea that states played a critical role in creating nationalist identities in order to generate support for state actions, “justifying such actions with nationalist arguments.”\(^3\) This paper reflects Breuilly’s appeal for more studies of national that focus on the state and applies a state-focused approach to the study of nationalism in Latin America, a region that has been neglected in traditional studies of nationalism.

While much of nationalism literature has focused on the origins of nations and nationalism before the end of the Cold War, contemporary scholars such as Marxist historian Eric Hobsbawm are focusing on the “new wave of nationalism” in the post-1989 period.\(^4\) In his analysis of the nationalist trajectory, Hobsbawm describes nationalism as declining in importance. Hobsbawm theorizes that the formation of nations in the post-World War II period is not due to self-determination but “decolonization, revolution, and of course, the intervention of

---

\(^3\) Ibid.
\(^4\) Ishay, 16.
outside powers,”29 and he argues that the nationalism of the late twentieth century is dissimilar to that of “the Eurocentric nineteenth-century world.”30 We are no longer, Hobsbawm contends, living in an era of “nation-building,” and consequently, nationalism will play a less prominent role as the world becomes increasingly economically connected.31 Hobsbawm's view reflects an economic determinist approach because it examines nationalism from an economic perspective and identifies globalization as essential to his explanation of nationalism. He asserts that while nations have been considered to be the modern form of political organization, nationalism is now more of a reaction against modernity that “attempts to erect barricades to keep at bay the forces of the modern world.”32 Hobsbawm maintains that as the importance of the state diminishes because of the forces of globalization, so will nationalist movements decrease. Ultimately, he concludes that the forces of a growing global economy will cause nationalist conflicts, namely those that characterized the late twentieth century, to decline. Although national identity continues to be a powerful social force in Chile and Peru, Hobsbawm's theory regarding the future of nationalism in a globalized world does relate to the national trajectories in Chile and Peru. Globalization and a growing international community have contributed to the expansion of national dialogues throughout Latin America, and as the international human rights movement acquires momentum, more and more marginalized groups are demanding inclusion and full access to their rights. International human rights norms have affected nationalism and the state

31 Ibid.
32 Ibid, 363.
actions in Chile and Peru, and most notably, they have helped indigenous rights and women's rights movements gain support throughout the region.\textsuperscript{33}

Though certain aspects of primordial and perennial theories of nationalism apply to the case of indigenous women in Peru and Chile, my examination of the national trajectories of these two countries demonstrates that nationalism should be understood primarily as modern and constructed. The arguments of Armstrong and Smith do pertain to national conceptions in Peru and Chile in that notions of boundaries and ethnicities factor into the discourse that has been formed, but they do not fully encompass the experiences of indigenous women who exist outside of the nation but within the state. Rather than tying national identity to pre-modern notions of who is native to Latin America, the elites who have dominated the national conversations in this region have articulated an imagined nationalism that consists primarily of men who identify as ethnically European rather than indigenous Peruvians or Chileans. The nationalisms that have formed in both Chile and Peru are a modern creation that have been used as a political tool by the state governments that formed after gaining independence from Spain. The arguments of both Gellner and Anderson regarding the nature of nationalism and the nation are proved to be correct in the case of indigenous women and nationalism in Peru and Chile. Gellner, who looks at nationalism through a political lens, has asserted that nationalism reflects the desire for the political unit and the nation to become one, and this theory serves as the basis for my study of nationalism in Chile and Peru. Since the beginning of Chile's history as an independent state, authorities with a nationalist agenda have sought to make the Chilean state reflect their perceptions of what the nation should be. The Peruvian case also supports Gellner's thesis, as seen in the way in which nationalist elites have rejected attempts by the government to more

\textsuperscript{33} Oliart, Patricia, "Indigenous Women's Organizations and the Political Discourses of Indigenous Rights and Gender Equity in Peru," \textit{Latin American and Caribbean Ethnic Studies} 3 no. 3 (2008), 292.
fully include indigenous peoples and women into state policies. The fact that the Peruvian government's efforts to expand public services to indigenous women have been so contested that they have led to regime change illustrates the belief of exclusive nationalists that the state should reflect their ideas of who belongs to the nation.

I utilize Anderson's definition of the nation as a limited, imagined community throughout my study of Peruvian and Chilean national discourses. That the nation is a social construction that relies upon perceptions of boundaries and belonging is critical to my analysis of nationalism in Peru and Chile, as both national dialogues rely upon notions of a community that does not fully include indigenous women and other marginalized groups even though they live within the borders of the state. Breuilly's understanding of nationalism also applies to my discussion of nationalism in these two countries. While Gellner and Anderson examine nationalism as modern phenomenon in political and sociological contexts, Breuilly advocates for an examination of nationalism that is based upon the modern political history of the state. Because the actions of the Chilean and Peruvian states can either reinforce or expand conceptions of the nation, I have chosen to evaluate the role of the Peruvian and Chilean states in articulating nationalist ideologies and the relationship between the state and the nation in my case study. Breuilly is correct in his assertion that the study of nationalism as a modern occurrence would benefit from a focus on the history of the state, but it is also critical to make a distinction, as Gellner does, between the state and the nation. As Gellner has argued, nationalism is the belief that the political entity of the state and the imagined community of the nation should be harmonious, and it is often utilized as a political tool by states.\textsuperscript{34} It is from this framework provided by Gellner

\textsuperscript{34}Gellner, 1.
that I will examine the formation of the Peruvian and Chilean nations and how the states of Peru and Chile have reflected exclusive perceptions of the nation that marginalize indigenous women.

The Study of Nationalism in Latin America

Despite the amount of research that has been conducted on the nation and national phenomena, there is a significant lack of literature on the unique way in which Latin American nations have been constructed and developed. It is essential that more analyses of nationalism in Latin America are undertaken, because as José Itzigsohn and Matthias vom Hau have asserted, the complex national, ethnic, and cultural identities of Latin America make it “particularly suited for tracing transformations of nationalism over time.”

National dialogues in Latin America have been described by scholars focusing on this region as “constantly emerging and changing” and marked by “internal cleavages [that] differentiate between strong and weak citizens; the latter being those groups that are marked as not fully belonging to the national community.” This paper explores these complexities in Latin America and identifies the relationship between gender, ethnic, and cultural identity in the Chilean and Peruvian nations. In doing so, I seek to fill the gap that exists in nationalism literature on Latin America.

Unlike Gellner, Smith, and Hobsbawm, Benedict Anderson does recognize the importance of examining nationalism outside of Europe and dedicates a section of *Imagined Communities*, called “Creole Pioneers,” to the study of the distinctive formation of the nation in the Americas. Anderson presents a departure from traditional nationalism theory, which has

---

38 Itzigsohn and vom Hau, 195.
tended to focus on national trajectories in Europe, and he asserts that “an unselfconscious provincialism had long skewed and distorted theorizing on the subject” of nationalism and the nation.\(^{39}\) Anderson describes the states that formed from Latin American independence movements as “creole [or mixed] states, formed and led by people who shared common language and common descent with those against whom they fought.”\(^{40}\) From the beginning of their existence, Latin American states consisted of people from various cultural and ethnic backgrounds. The interaction of these diverse identities, Anderson explains, resulted in imaginings of national communities that were distinct from those of Europe. The unique and hybrid identities of Latin America that are described by Anderson have resulted in complex constructions of nationalism that often involve marginalization and violence against many who live within the state. The exclusion that Mapuche women in Chile have experienced throughout the history of modern Latin America exemplifies this repression, and the challenges associated with attempts to change Peruvian conceptions of nationalism illustrate the marginalization that continues even as Latin American societies seek to expand national identity.

Although Itzigsohn and vom Hau commend Anderson for his attention to the formation of the nation in Latin America, they take issue with his analysis in the "Creole Pioneers" chapter of *Imagined Communities*. They argue that Anderson overlooks the way in which the "creole pioneers," who were usually upper-class mestizos identifying primarily as European although they were of both European and indigenous backgrounds, did not seek to extend their nation-building discourse that was based on "ideas about popular sovereignty and citizenship" to "subaltern actors," such as indigenous people and women.\(^{41}\) Ultimately, Itzigsohn and vom Hau

\(^{39}\) Anderson, xiii.

\(^{40}\) Ibid, 47.

\(^{41}\) Itzigsohn and vom Hau, 194.
problematize Anderson's explanation as "elite-centered" and call for a more comprehensive examination of nationalism in Latin America.\textsuperscript{42} They, like Breuilly, are advocates for a “state-focused approach” to the study of nationalism because elite-controlled states have played a critical role in shaping national conceptions in the region.\textsuperscript{43} Latin America-focused scholars such as Sarah Radcliffe and Sallie Westwood also argue that Latin American state governments can play an important part in expanding or limiting national imaginings, as their policies can either seek to expand citizenship to all those living within their borders or reflect an exclusionary nationalist agenda that does not grant rights to those who are not perceived as belonging to the nation.\textsuperscript{44}

Itzigsohn and vom Hau disagree with the belief of many nationalism theorists that nationalism is either a “political ideology” or a “shared cultural script.”\textsuperscript{45} According to Itzigsohn and vom Hau, nationalism in Latin America has been both a political ideology as discussed by Gellner and Breuilly and a cultural script as discussed by Anderson and can be best understood in this way. In their analysis of Latin American national trajectories, Itzigsohn and vom Hau identify four issues that operated concurrently to greatly affect how nationalism has been transformed in the region. These four features are the level of “social mobilization in society,” which helps determine the way in which national identity can develop, the amount and manner of “political control of state elites” who seek to shape national identity, the capability of the state to control nationalist loyalties, and “the degree of ethnoracial cleavage and conflict present in society.”\textsuperscript{46} The framework provided by Itzigsohn and vom Hau for analyzing Latin American

\textsuperscript{42} Itzigsohn and vom Hau, 194.
\textsuperscript{43} Ibid, 193-194.
\textsuperscript{44} Radcliffe, Sarah and Sallie Westwood, \textit{Remaking the Nation: Place, identity and politics in Latin America} (London: Routledge, 1996), 13-14.
\textsuperscript{45} Itzigsohn and vom Hau, 196.
\textsuperscript{46} Ibid, 199.
nations provides scholars with a more concentrated approach to the study of nationalism at a regional and state level. Itzigsohn and vom Hau argue that it is essential to examine the specific conditions in Latin America in order to gain a comprehensive understanding of nationalism because the imagined communities of this region are constantly evolving and changing.

In my examination of the literature on nationalism in Latin America, I find that scholars concentrating on this region often did not make a clear distinction between the nation and the state. Latin American state governments, which have been controlled by an elite ruling class throughout history, play an essential role in advancing exclusive national agendas, but there should be a greater acknowledgement in Latin America-focused scholarship that the nation and the state are not the same. Scholars who have made important contributions to the study of nationalism in Latin America such as James Dunkerly, Greg Urban, and Joel Sherzer have mistakenly referred to Latin American "nation-states" in their analyses, conflating the two terms and implying that the nation and the state have successfully become congruent. Scholars such as Itzigsohn and vom Hau are correct to emphasize the role of the state in influencing the national trajectory, but analyses of national movements in Latin America would benefit from more clearly defined understandings of the nation, the state, and the relationship between them. In my analysis of nationalism in Latin America, I seek to identify the roles of the Chilean and Peruvian state governments in furthering hegemonic national dialogues while maintaining Gellner's assertion that the nation and the state are two distinct concepts.
Nationalism and Indigenous Women: Chile and Peru in comparative perspective

Indigenous Women and the Construction of National Identities in the Post-Colonial Period

Patricia Richards, who has conducted numerous studies on the situation of Mapuche women in Chile, contends that “in Latin America, despite a long-standing emphasis on cultural and racial mixedness, nation-building ideologies have long subordinated women, Blacks, the indigenous, and mestizos to men of purportedly European descent.”\(^{47}\) After the states of Chile and Peru gained independence from Spain in 1818 and 1824, respectively,\(^{48}\) both countries entered into a period of "nation building" in which male elites sought to disseminate national sentiments that could be utilized as a tool of the state.\(^{49}\) Although it was common for women to support and to actively participate in the independence movement in Latin America, the hegemonic nationalisms that formed when independence was achieved was largely exclusive of women as a group.\(^{50}\) Throughout the period of nation-building in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, women, indigenous people, and especially indigenous women, were relegated to the margins of society and not fully included in the dominant ideas of who belonged to the Chilean and Peruvian nations.\(^{51}\) The exclusive national communities that were constructed during this time in Latin America have had lasting effects on the status of indigenous women.

\(^{47}\) Richards, Patricia, “Bravas, Permitidas, Obsoletas: Mapuche Women in the Chilean Print Media,” Gender and Society 21, no. 4 (2007), 555.


\(^{49}\) Gutiérrez Chong, 12-13.

\(^{50}\) Ibid, 10-11.

\(^{51}\) Appelbaum, et al, 14.
throughout the region. Natividad Gutiérrez Chong, who has examined gender and ethnicity in Latin America within the context of nationalism, finds that although nationalist notions of the roles of women have expanded over time, indigenous women still experience significant national exclusion: "The indigenous woman is profoundly degraded. Proof of this is the multiple acts of daily and political life providing evidence of mistreatment, discrimination, rejection and ridicule."52

The state has played a critical role in furthering the hegemonic national discourse in Chile through its creation of policies that have restricted the rights of women, indigenous peoples, and other groups that are not perceived as belonging to the imagined Chilean nation.53 This state-sanctioned marginalization reflects John Breuilly’s assertion that state policies often further the dominant national ideology and that the state utilizes national dialogues to gain political support.54 Although women have increasingly been included into the Chilean nation in recent years, the history of Chile has been marked by the limiting of women’s citizenship and gendered national conceptions. Women in Chile did not receive full voting rights until 1949, after a long struggle by Chilean feminists in a country where many “were not entirely comfortable with the idea of women’s rights.”55 Richards explains that many Mapuche women experience “triple discrimination against them as women, as indigenous, and as poor.”56

The dominant Chilean nationalist discourse identifies the Mapuche as courageous historical figures because they resisted Spanish colonization efforts and successfully kept

52 Gutiérrez Chong, 18.
54 Breuilly, 3.
55 Pernet, Corinne A., "Chilean Feminists, the International Women's Movement, and Suffrage, 1915-1950," The Pacific Historical Review 69, no. 4 (2000), 688. For more information regarding the women’s suffrage movement in Chile, see this article.
56 Richards, “Expanding, Women's Citizenship?” 50.
Spanish troops from advancing past the Bio-Bio River in the south of Chile.\textsuperscript{57} Although the Mapuche are represented in Chilean history as “a symbol of Chilean valor in the face of Spanish domination,”\textsuperscript{58} after Chile achieved its independence from Spain and established itself as a state, the Mapuche were expected by Chilean authorities to abandon indigenous practices that were not considered part of the national culture and “assimilate as Chilean like anyone else.”\textsuperscript{59} Because the newly formed Chilean government was made up of the "white" male elite in Chile who belonged to the “Chilean nation,” the policies of the Chilean state reinforced nationalist ideologies. When the Mapuche sought to maintain their identity and way of life, the newly formed Chilean state began its campaigns to seize the Mapuche’s land.\textsuperscript{60} The effects of “political control of the state elite” that is discussed in Itzigsohn and vom Hau's analysis of Latin American nationalism is exemplified in the case of Chile.\textsuperscript{61}

As the Chilean state became more and more centralized, it increased its efforts to "put an end to the Indian problem" through military invasions and land seizures that were executed during the late nineteenth century and furthered the elite's national discourse through its exclusion of the indigenous peoples of Chile.\textsuperscript{62} 1882 is referred to by historians as the year of the "Final Defeat of the Mapuche," in which the Mapuche had the majority of their territory taken from them and were forced to alter their way of life.\textsuperscript{63} Gellner’s assertion that nationalism “holds that the political and the national unit should be congruent” proves to be correct in this case, as nationalist authorities sought to make the newly formed Chilean state reflect their understanding

\textsuperscript{58} Maybury-Lewis, 210.
\textsuperscript{59} Richards, Patricia, “Politics of Gender, Human Rights, and Being Indigenous,” 207.
\textsuperscript{60} Maybury-Lewis, 210.
\textsuperscript{61} Itzigsohn and vom Hau, 199.
\textsuperscript{62} Maybury-Lewis, 210.
\textsuperscript{63} Ibid, 208.
of what the nation should be.\textsuperscript{64} Despite the fact that the Mapuche are living within the borders of the state of Chile, they are not included in Chilean imaginings of the nation, demonstrating the claim of Gellner, Anderson, and others that although the state and the nation are connected, they are not the same.

Although the percentage of those living in Peru who identify as indigenous is much larger than that of Chile, indigenous people in Peru have been marginalized in the national discourse throughout modern Peruvian history. As in Chile, the national ideologies that formed during the nation-building period in Peru simultaneously exalted indigenous culture as an important part of the nation's history and identified those who did not abandon their indigenous Andean identity after Peru gained its independence from Spain as "backward" and not a part of the Peruvian nation.\textsuperscript{65} Maruja Barrig discusses the influence of Peru's Incan past on national conceptions, explaining that "despite the contemporary bias against 'Indians,' the Incan Empire…is seen by a majority of Peruvians as the period of greatest splendor and glory in Peruvian national history, a Golden Age of harmony, justice, and abundance."\textsuperscript{66} Urban and Sherzer identify this glorification and reinvention of indigenous culture to achieve a nationalist agenda as "folklorization," a strategy that was employed by political elites in Latin America in order to expand their control over the population.\textsuperscript{67} In spite of the fact that the Incan Empire has been a source of national pride in Peru, indigenous people living in postcolonial Peru have been discriminated against by the national community of the elite even though they are the descendents of the Incans. The system of "'white' republicanism" that was established during Peru's early years as a state

\textsuperscript{64} Gellner, 1.
\textsuperscript{67} Urban and Sherzer, 10.
illustrates the way in which national identity has been used as political tool in Peru. The elite class's construction of an exclusive Peruvian nation allowed the newly formed government to prevent indigenous people and women from participating in democratic political processes, and during this time in Peru, "entire groups of people were barred from access to citizenship and liberty according to Eurocentric, class-, and gender-exclusionary criteria."  

It is important to note that while national discourses were built and utilized as a political tool during the early histories of both Chile and Peru, elites were not as successful in disseminating a hegemonic national discourse in Peru as they were in Chile. The construction of national identity in Peru has been a contested process due to the fragmented nature of Peruvian society in the postcolonial period as well as the large percentage of the Peruvian population that identified as indigenous during this time. The Peruvian nation was imagined by upper-class Europeans and mestizos in Lima, Peru's coastal capital, and it essentially ignored the indigenous makeup of the Andean regions of the country. While the goal of these political elites was to eliminate the "backwardness" of indigenous traditions and transform Peru into a unified, modernized, and European-like nation, the Peruvian government in Lima was not successful in making its nationalist agenda a reality because it was not able to dominate its large Quechua population in the same way that the Chilean state was able to repress the smaller Mapuche community. Instead, male political elites of European descent sought to disseminate ideas about the nation among the members of the upper-class that ignored and excluded nearly half of the population.

---

70 McClintock, Cynthia, 430.
71 García, 64.
the population. Therefore, although the nation that was constructed at this time has contributed significantly to the institutionalization of both racism and sexism in the Peruvian government, it has not given the Peruvian state the widespread authority over marginalized sectors of the population that it sought during the nation-building period. This inability of the state to utilize the national discourse in order to gain control of the indigenous population is often referred to as the "Indian problem." 

While Chilean elites addressed the nation's perceived "Indian problem" through violent, state-sanctioned campaigns that sought to eliminate the indigenous way of life, the complexities associated with the "Indian problem" in Peru were much greater and less easily addressed. The questions of how to address the "Indian problem" and make the state of Peru reflect hegemonic perceptions of the Peruvian nation have been long-standing ones. Political elites blamed Peru's defeat in the territorial War of the Pacific with Chile, which began in 1879 and ended in 1883, on the absence of national unity in Peru and on "ethnic diversity, specifically on the lack of indigenous nationalist sentiment." Florencia Mallon analyzes the sentiments of nationalism that developed following Peru's loss in the War of the Pacific, explaining that "by recasting a problem of race and class repression as a lack of indigenous modernity…creole elites essentially buried their own practices of racist exclusion in a lament about the 'prepolitical' or 'prehistorical' Indian." The national ideologies that were articulated following this defeat identified the indigenous citizens of Peru as backward outsiders who were an impediment to the successful realization of nationalist goals of modernization and cultural assimilation. Exclusive imaginings

---

72 Mallon, Peasant and Nation, 292.
75 García, 67.
76 Mallon, "Decoding the Parchments," 25.
of the nation and the perceived "Indian problem" in Peru have had lasting effects on the way in which indigenous people, and especially indigenous women, have been ignored by the Peruvian government and overlooked in state policies and programs.\footnote{Boesten, 2-4.}

Despite the multiethnic background of most Latin Americans, national discourses in this region have often denied the nation's indigenous roots.\footnote{Appelbaum, et al., 6.} In Chile, approximately eighty percent of people are mestizo, or of both European and indigenous descent.\footnote{Richards, "Bravas, Permitidas, Obsoletas," 558.} However, those living within Chile's borders generally identify themselves as either "Chilean," which implies someone of European descent, or "Mapuche."\footnote{Ibid.} During the nation building period in Chile, mestizos were encouraged to "whiten their racial stock" by abandoning a part of their identity and cultural heritage.\footnote{Appelbaum, et al, 14.} The Mapuche have been constructed as the "other" within Chile, although they share a common ethnic background with many members of the Chilean nation. The case of the Mapuche in Chile suggests that the argument of primordialists such as John Armstrong and Anthony Smith that sentiments of nationalism are derived from one's ethnicity is not accurate, as nationalism in Chile is not based the realities of ethnic background but on constructed ideas of what it means to be "Chilean." The fact that "the Chilean term indo (Indian) is a derogatory term used by Chileans to refer to the Mapuche and is often associated with laziness, drunkenness, or stupidity"\footnote{Bacigalupo, 33.} illustrates the discrimination that is based on the notion that the Mapuche are the unacceptable "other" and the "Chileans" do not share a common heritage with indigenous peoples. The policies of the Chilean state have reflected this separation of the Mapuche from Chilean national identity.

\footnote{Boesten, 2-4.} \footnote{Appelbaum, et al., 6.} \footnote{Richards, "Bravas, Permitidas, Obsoletas," 558.} \footnote{Ibid.} \footnote{Appelbaum, et al, 14.} \footnote{Bacigalupo, 33.}
In Peru, as in Chile, the dominant national conversation created a "dualism between Indian and white" that forced ethnic mestizos to abandon a part of their heritage.\(^8\) To be integrated into the nation and become an accepted in this imagined community, Peruvian citizens are required to reject their indigenous roots. Those who have not done so are marginalized by this "hegemonic social and political discourse" that has been utilized by the state of Peru throughout its history.\(^8\) Barrig discusses the way in which exclusive nationalist sentiments that demand cultural assimilation are reflected in government policies: "citizenship in Peru has been constructed at the cost of loss of identity of the diverse ethnic groups that inhabit it: men and women must adopt customs and Western clothes and use Spanish to be able to exercise their basic rights."\(^8\) Men of indigenous descent have been able to conform to national imaginings in Peru far more than have women due to the gendered nature of access to education in Peru, the lack of Spanish instruction for women whose first language is Quechua, and the bias against women entering the formal labor sector in Peru.\(^8\) As Barrig asserts, "there is a marked differentiation between indigenous men, who may adopt mestizo clothing and language, and women, who are considered symbols of Indian identity."\(^8\) Indigenous women are prevented from integrating into the Peruvian nation both by political elites and by the men in their own communities, who view it unacceptable for women, as the keepers of culture, to speak Spanish and move away from traditional practices. Quechua women, like Mapuche women in Chile, are subject to the "triple discrimination"\(^8\) discussed by Richards and others because they are women, indigenous, and of low socioeconomic status.

---

\(^8\) Mallon, "Decoding the Parchments," 25.  
\(^8\) Barrig, 118.  
\(^8\) Ibid.  
\(^8\) García, 102-103.  
\(^8\) Barrig, 120.  
\(^8\) Richards, "Expanding Women's Citizenship?" 50.
Contemporary Nationalism and the State: An examination of the governments of Chile and Peru

The governments of Chile and Peru have reflected nationalist ideologies in many of their policies and have carried out nation-building initiatives that have overlooked and ignored indigenous women. Although the state and the nation are two distinct concepts, the Chilean and Peruvian states have sought to utilize conceptions of the nation in order to secure their control over those living in the state and maintain an elitist social hierarchy. Nationalism has greatly influenced the actions of these states, and in this section I identify the relationship between the state and the nation in Peru and Chile from the 1970s to present-day. I find that even when the state has sought to make its policies more inclusive and expand the national discourse to include those who have been marginalized, as in the case of Peru during the government of General Juan Velasco, the protests of nationalist elites have prevented these changes from being realized.  

In her analysis of national exclusion of the Mapuche, Mallon asserts that "a common way to think about the Mapuche in Chile is to deny that they presently exist." This denial was exemplified in the policies of military dictator Augusto Pinochet, who executed a campaign of extreme nationalism in which the persecution of women, the Mapuche, and those who did not belong to the constructed Chilean nation, was institutionalized further by the state. While President Salvador Allende sought to include rural workers and the Mapuche in state policies and expand imaginations of the Chilean nation through government reform, an extreme nationalist backlash occurred when the 1973 military coup put Pinochet in power. Allende's agrarian

---

89 García, 73-74.
90 Mallon, "Decoding the Parchments," 49.
92 Maybury-Lewis, 212-213.
reform policies, which returned land seized by the Chilean government back to the Mapuche, were reversed by Pinochet, marking the beginning of rampant state-sanctioned discrimination between 1973 and 1990.\(^{93}\)

During Pinochet's regime, many Mapuche disappeared and were exiled or killed at the hands of the Chilean government.\(^{94}\) The dictatorship furthered the nationalistic notion that the Mapuche were a cultural relic of the past and an impediment to modernization, it and aimed to "folklorize" Mapuche culture into something marketable and commercial.\(^{95}\) It was during this time that Mapuche activism, which operated under the protective umbrella of the Catholic Church, shifted from seeking inclusion in the Chilean national discourse and recognition by the Chilean state to imagining themselves as part of a separate, Mapuche nation that was "allied against the Chilean state."\(^{96}\) In her testimony *When a Flower is Reborn: the Life and Times of a Mapuche Feminist*, Isolde Reunque describes the strengthening of Mapuche identity under Pinochet: "when the repression was greatest, the Mapuche movement was strongest: with militant revival of our language, our traditions, our traditional organizations."\(^{97}\) It was also in this period that women gained prominence in the Mapuche rights movement, and feminist activists such as Isolde Reunque, Ana Llao, and Elisa Avendaño were some of the "most important Mapuche leaders during the dictatorship."\(^{98}\) These women worked to both to promote Mapuche

\(^{93}\) Richards, "Politics of Gender, Human Rights, and Being Indigenous," 207.
\(^{94}\) Ibid.
\(^{96}\) Bacigalupo, 35.
\(^{97}\) Reuque Paillalaf, 115.
identity and rights in general and address the specific discrimination experienced by Mapuche women.  

The military government that took power in Peru in 1968 did not utilize an exclusive national discourse, nor did it reflect hegemonic national imaginings in the way that the Pinochet regime did in Chile. Instead, the military coup led by General Juan Velasco Alvarado was the military's attempt to address the widespread social inequality in Peru and to include the large portion of the population that was not considered to be part of the Peruvian nation. In her analysis of Velasco's military government, Cynthia McClintock contends that "proclaiming a 'revolutionary government of the armed forces' that would build a 'fully participatory social democracy,' the Velasco government finally curtailed the power of Peru's oligarchy." However, the extent to which the Velasco government was actually able to reshape Peru's national discourse is questionable, and ultimately, the opposition of the nationalist elite to Velasco's vision of inclusion led to his removal from power. As Jelke Boesten maintains, the era in which Velasco was in power "was marked by well-intentioned but largely failed attempts to break with the old order, the oligarchy, and the extremes of inequality in order to establish a new national project that would incorporate the rural Indian population." Despite this, though, the Velasco government can be considered revolutionary because it was the most significant attempt ever undertaken by a Peruvian political leader to reject the dominant national dialogue in favor of supporting a more comprehensive perception of the nation.

One of the major priorities of Velasco was inclusion of the marginalized indigenous population, and the reforms he instituted sought to defy "the existing power dynamics throughout

---

99 Ibid.
100 McClintock, 434.
101 Boesten, 9.
the country. Among these policy initiatives were agrarian reform and the establishment of Quechua as an official language of Peru. In recognizing Quechua as a Peruvian language, the Velasco government aimed to change national conceptions and unite the people of Peru under a more inclusive national dialogue that transformed indigenous identity into Peruvian identity. However, this law evoked significant opposition from the upper-class and middle-class citizens of Lima, who demanded that the Peruvian state reflect their exclusive national imaginings. The nationalist resistance among Peruvian elites was strong during this time and led to the 1975 "palace coup" that put General Francisco Morales Bernúdez in power. This regime change marked a return to a Peruvian government that reflected the nationalist sentiments of the elite. Morales Bernúdez revoked many of the reforms introduced by Velasco, curtailing agrarian reform and altering the law that made Quechua an official language so that it would be identified as secondary to Spanish.

In 1980, after seventeen years of authoritarian rule, democratic elections were held in Peru. However, these elections coincided with the rise of the terrorist group Sendero Luminoso (Shining Path), which declared war on the Peruvian state in that same year. The Sendero Luminoso movement began in the Andean city of Ayacucho and was conceived by Abimael Guzmán, a university professor who mobilized provincial students seeking power and influence in Peru to support his cause. Sendero Luminoso identified itself as a Maoist revolutionary movement that would overthrow the Peruvian government and bring about a new social order,

---

102 García, 74.
103 García, 74.
104 Ibid, 75.
105 Ibid, 76.
106 McClintock, 434.
107 Qtd. in García, 76.
108 Boesten, 9.
109 García, 38.
but it did so largely without the participation of Peru's indigenous people. As María Elena García
and other scholars have elucidated, "the assumption that Sendero was an ethnic movement, or a
movement advocating indigenous rights, was clearly wrong and later dismissed by most
observers." In fact, many of the terrorist acts of Sendero Luminoso targeted communities of
rural Quechua farm workers because they would not join in the Sendero movement, illustrating
the "paradox that Shining Path's so-called people's war—which was supposed to destroy existing
power relations in favor of the poor—led to an escalation in violence against the already
marginalized."  

The actions of the state during the nearly twenty year civil war in Peru reflected an
extreme form of nationalism that identified the indigenous citizens of Peru as a threat to the
nation's existence. Although Sendero Luminoso was not an indigenous movement, the Peruvian
government identified it as such because it originated in the country's Andean region and
advocated for the redistribution of land and wealth. Sendero's attacks against the state soon
prompted the Peruvian government to deploy troops to indigenous communities in the Andean
highlands. In 1982, the government of newly elected President Fernando Belaúnde Terry
declared the Andean highlands of the country to be "zonas de emergencia," or areas that were in
a state of emergency. In these essentially lawless zones, gender-based violence was rampant,
and forced prostitution as well as forced abortions became a reality for many of the Quechua
women caught in the middle of the fighting between Sendero Luminoso and the Peruvian
military. The upper-class mestizo armed forces deployed to the zonas de emergencia did not
speak Quechua and failed to make a distinction between Sendero fighters and indigenous

---

110 García, 39.
111 Boesten, 11.
112 Ibid, 111.
113 Ibid.
civilians. As a result, thousands of Quechua living in the highlands "were killed or disappeared as part of government efforts to eliminate the opposition."\textsuperscript{114} When the Peruvian Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) was established to investigate the human rights abuses that were committed during the civil, it was found that 85\% of those who were killed or disappeared during the conflict were Quechua.\textsuperscript{115} The Quechua women who lived in these \textit{zonas de emergencia} during the civil war were constantly subjected to gender-based sexual violence committed by the state, and the 2003 report of the TRC found that many women in indigenous communities had been victims of "systematic rape [that] was perpetrated by the army and police forces."\textsuperscript{116} The atrocities committed against Quechua women by the state during the civil war have had lasting consequences for these women, and Amnesty International discusses these effects in its 2009 report on indigenous women and maternal health services in Peru:

The legacy of widespread and gross abuses during the armed conflict continues to affect the lives of women today. Many have complained of mental and physical health problems, including concerning reproductive health, resulting from the violence to which they were subjected. It is only by understanding this legacy that the mistrust and fear that Indigenous and campesina women have of the authorities and of people from outside their community can be understood.\textsuperscript{117}

The Peruvian state utilized the dominant national discourse to justify its actions during this time, and it was able to conduct its attacks on indigenous people, and indigenous women in particular, because it did so under the guise of protecting the nation.\textsuperscript{118}

Alberto Fujimori was elected president of Peru in 1990 amidst the backdrop of a conflict that was disproportionally affecting indigenous civilians and spreading fear throughout the

\textsuperscript{114} García, 42.
\textsuperscript{115} Boesten, 12.
\textsuperscript{116} Ibid, 112.
\textsuperscript{118} Boesten, 111-112.
country. As the son of Japanese parents who had immigrated to Peru, Fujimori campaigned for the presidency as an outsider without any previous political experience, as he had been a mathematics professor and the head of a university prior to his presidential campaign. Fujimori presented himself as an alternative to the nationalist elites in Peru, but once in office, he utilized the national discourse that had intensified during the war with Sendero Luminoso in order to gain complete and total control of the Peruvian government. In 1992, under the pretense of needing to defeat Sendero Luminoso and protect the Peruvian national imaginings that were under threat during this period, Fujimori re-structured the government through what has been called an autogolpe (self-coup), disbanding the Peruvian Congress as well as the Supreme Court. Five months after Fujimori consolidated his power through the autogolpe, "his (now infamous) national intelligence agency (SIN) captured Abimael Guzmán and declared that the war would soon be over." Without Guzmán as its leader, Sendero Luminoso lost much of its momentum and began to disband. However, Fujimori did not discontinue his authoritarian practices when the civil war drew to a close, and he would continue to implement rights-violating policies that marginalized indigenous women for several years to come.

When the conflict with Sendero Luminoso was coming to a close, Fujimori shifted his focus to addressing the "Indian problem" through repressive development policies that sought to curtail the growth of the Quechua population. During this time, the Fujimori government implemented rights-violating reproductive health policies that treated indigenous women as an impediment to modernization in Peru. In 1996, Fujimori's Health Ministry, began the "Voluntary Surgical Contraception" (VSC) program, which targeted women in low-income Quechua

119 McClintock, 435-436.
120 García, 48.
121 Ibid, 50.
Although the VSC program was presented as a voluntary reproductive health service, more than 300,000 indigenous women were forcibly sterilized by VSC health officials between 1996 and 2000. The fact-finding research of human rights lawyer Giulia Tamayo found that during this time, Fujimori's Health Ministry mandated that VSC health officials throughout the country meet its sterilization quotas "not only after delivery but also as a part of women's medical examinations." Health officials received money from the government for every woman they sterilized and were given bonuses of money or goods when they met their designated quotas. Additionally, women were coerced into participating in the sterilization program with bribes of food and threats of being fined by the government if they became pregnant in the future. The VSC program took advantage of the high illiteracy rates and low levels of Spanish proficiency among Quechua women, forcing them to sign consent forms in Spanish for surgical sterilization. In other cases, indigenous women who refused the procedure were drugged and tied up so that VSC officials could operate. Indigenous women's rights leader and current congresswoman Hilaria Supa has taken an active role in exposing the forced sterilization campaign of the 1990s and the way in which indigenous women were treated "as if they were animals" during this time:

Without explaining things properly, they have done terrible things to us, women. Because here, nurses did not think we were people. At that point they thought we were animals. That's how they tied women's tubes, forcing us, bring us in cars to the health centres to

---

124 Ibid.
125 Oliart, 302.
126 See Boesten, 81 and Paez, "Peru: Charges Possible in Fujimori-Era Sterilization Program."
128 Paez, "Peru: Charges Possible in Fujimori-Era Sterilization Program."
129 Paez, "Peru: Native Women Forcibly Sterilized Renew Their Case for Justice."
130 Qtd. in Oliart, 302.
butcher us like sheep, sometimes over the bare floor, not even in a bed, that is a painful
memory we will always keep in our hearts.\footnote{Qtd. in Oliart, 302.}

Because they were not considered to be members of the Peruvian nation but rather as an obstacle
to the political goal of making the state reflect hegemonic national imaginings, Quechua women
living in Peru were subject to widespread human rights violations during the Fujimori regime. In
order to achieve his authoritarian agendas, Fujimori utilized the exclusive nationalist ideologies
of the Peruvian elite in order to execute a devastating campaign of forced sterilization that
continues to affect indigenous women both psychologically and physically due to the unsafe
conditions under which these operations were performed. To date, the perpetrators of the
sterilization campaign have yet to be brought to justice in the Peruvian judicial system, despite
the recent appeals of Quechua women's rights groups as well as the Inter-American Commission
on Human Rights (IACHR) to bring the forced sterilization case to court.\footnote{Paez, "Peru: Native Women Forcibly Sterilized Renew Their Case for Justice."}

In 2000, Fujimori was forced to resign after charges of widespread corruption were
brought against him.\footnote{\textit{BBC News}, "Mass sterilization scandal shocks Peru."} After nearly a decade of Fujimori's rule, democracy was restored in Peru,
and in 2001, the Peruvian government established the Truth and Reconciliation Commission to
investigate the human rights abuses carried out between 1980 and 2000 in Peru.\footnote{García, 54.} The findings
of the TRC pay particular attention to the way in which indigenous women were affected by
political violence in Peru and represent an important step towards incorporating indigenous
women into the national dialogue. The Peruvian TRC was "the first Truth Commission
internationally to deal with violence against women in a special committee," and the final report
of the TRC illustrates the discrimination experienced by Quechua women throughout these two
decades. This report marked an attempt by the state to incorporate Quechua women in its reconciliation efforts and to recognize them as victims of the ideologies that had dominated the country's national discourse throughout history. In her analysis of the TRC's inclusion of women, Boesten explains that "the report explicitly shows how inequalities based on ethnicity, gender, and class can be a basis for extreme violence and hatred, and for impunity and indifference." The efforts of the TRC illustrate the potential for further expansion of national conceptions in Peru to include indigenous women. However, the Peruvian government has continued to reflect a hegemonic form of nationalism in many of its present-day policies and actions, and more needs to be done to effectively expand perceptions of the nation in Peru and ensure that indigenous women exercise their rights.

After many years of authoritarian rule, both Chile and Peru are in need of new, more inclusive conceptions of the nation that cannot be utilized as justification for excluding sectors of the Chilean and Peruvian populations. Despite the differences in the sizes of their indigenous populations and the issues these peoples face, there is much that must be done in both countries in order to incorporate indigenous women into state policies and programs that have traditionally reflected exclusive national ideologies. When democracy was restored in Chile in 1990, there was much hope for the expansion of the national community to include both women and the Mapuche. With Pinochet out of power after 17 years of repression, the Mapuche once again mobilized to work with the Chilean state with the objective of obtaining full rights and recognition. During Concertación (Chile's center-left alliance) presidential candidate Patricio Aylwin's campaign in 1989, Mapuche leaders signed a pact with him that stated that under his administration, indigenous peoples would receive constitutional recognition and a government
agency would be established to address indigenous issues.\(^\text{137}\) Richards explains that the Chilean state made two important steps toward the inclusion of the Mapuche in 1993, when Indigenous Law was created "for the protection and expansion of land and water rights" and the National Corporation of Indigenous Development (CONADI) was established.\(^\text{138}\) However, the Mapuche and other indigenous groups in Chile have yet to receive constitutional recognition due to sentiments of nationalism among Chilean government officials.\(^\text{139}\) One conservative senator, Sergio Diéz, argued against constitutional recognition in a senate meeting in 1999, saying "we are one people…the Chilean people."\(^\text{140}\)

The formation of CONADI gave the Chilean state a new mechanism with which to promote Mapuche rights and a re-imagining of the Chilean nation to include indigenous women. However, CONADI has been criticized within Mapuche communities as "underfunded, bureaucratic, and inefficient" and a symbolic measure rather than a real instrument of change.\(^\text{141}\) Because Concertación initiatives to address discrimination against the Mapuche have been perceived as ineffective by the Mapuche, numerous Mapuche NGOs have been created that utilize "diffuse forms of activism and protest."\(^\text{142}\) In 1991, the first Mapuche women's organization was created, and many others have been established since then in response to the male hegemony that has dominated Chile's history and the lack of recognition of indigenous issues in the feminist movement in Chile.\(^\text{143}\)

\(^{137}\) Richards, "Politics of Gender, Human Rights, and Being Indigenous, 208.
\(^{138}\) Ibid.
\(^{139}\) Ibid.
\(^{140}\) Qtd. in Richards, "Politics of Gender, Human Rights, and Being Indigenous," 208.
\(^{141}\) Richards, "Expanding Women's Citizenship?" 47.
\(^{142}\) Ibid.
\(^{143}\) Reuque Paillalef, 223-224.
One of the most significant achievements of the post-dictatorship government in Chile was the establishment of the National Women's Service (SERNAM). SERNAM has contributed to the inclusion of women in Chile's national discourse, and Richards elucidates that because of SERNAM and affiliated women's groups, "the official image of the Chilean citizen is no longer exclusively male."\textsuperscript{144} However, SERNAM has neglected to address important issues facing Mapuche women who live in Chile, and the first Equal Opportunities Plan formulated by SERNAM made no mention of rural or indigenous women. As a result, Mapuche women's rights groups appealed to SERNAM to amend its plan, and in 1997, a second Equal Opportunities Plan was created to include mention of the experiences of indigenous and rural women.\textsuperscript{145} While its second plan marked an important step toward the recognition of the discrimination faced by Mapuche women, SERNAM has been criticized for not yet fully addressing this multifaceted marginalization.\textsuperscript{146} If SERNAM hopes to expand Chilean citizenship to include Mapuche women, it should recognize that many Mapuche women living in urban areas "are often not hired for jobs in which they would be attending the public because their physical characteristics do not accord with Chilean standards of beauty."\textsuperscript{147} It should take into account the fact that many women in Chile not identifying as Mapuche do not see Mapuche women as equals, hiring them as domestic servants who do not receive fair wages and are constantly berated with ethnic slurs by their female employers.\textsuperscript{148} And ultimately, this organization has to acknowledge the institutionalized discrimination against the Mapuche as a people if it hopes to move away from the hegemonic nationalist discourse in Chile and promote the rights of all women living within the state of Chile.

\textsuperscript{144} Richards, "Expanding Women's Citizenship?" 48-49.
\textsuperscript{145} Ibid, 55.
\textsuperscript{146} Ibid, 56-57.
\textsuperscript{147} Ibid, 50.
\textsuperscript{148} Ibid, 50-51.
Women are being increasingly incorporated into the nation in Chile, and the election of
female president Michelle Bachelet in 2006 marked a turning point for the way in which the
country in Chile is understood.\textsuperscript{149} However, the exclusion of women continues in Chile, and there
are many sectors of the population that are not considered to be part of the Chilean nation. The
election of Sebastian Piñera to the presidency in 2010 has served as a setback to state efforts to
include women and marked a return to state actions that reflect a gendered national discourse in
Chile. The first conservative candidate to be elected president since the re-establishment of
democracy in the country, President Piñera has yet to make the advancement of women a priority
of his administration, and the number of women occupying government positions, especially at
the ministerial level, dropped significantly after he took office.\textsuperscript{150} Piñera's perceived lack of
commitment to gender inclusiveness has been a cause for concern among feminist scholars in
Chile, and whether or not he will work to combat gender-based discrimination during his term as
president remains to be seen.\textsuperscript{151} Mapuche women, who experience discrimination because of
their gender, ethnic identity, and socioeconomic status, will undoubtedly be disproportionately
affected by gendered sentiments of nationalism in the years to come unless there is a
concentrated effort to expand the national dialogue in Chile.

The frustrations of Mapuche communities have strengthened conceptions of a Mapuche
nation and led to movements for Mapuche autonomy that have, in some cases, utilized violent

\textsuperscript{149} Rohter, Larry, "A Leader Makes Peace with Chile's Past," \textit{New York Times}, 16 January 2006,
http://www.nytimes.com/2006/01/16/international/americas/16winner.html?r=1&scp=3&sq=michele%20bachelet%
20women&st=cse. For more information on the election of Michelle Bachelet, see this article.
\textsuperscript{150} Página 12, "Chile: un año sin Bachelet," 25 February 2010,
and the Piñera administration, see this article.
\textsuperscript{151} Ibid.
methods of protest.\textsuperscript{152} In recent years, Mapuche communities in the south of Chile have seen highways constructed through their lands, a disproportionate number of garbage dumps in their communities, state-backed construction of a dam that flooded sacred Mapuche sites and forced Mapuche people from their homes, and restricted access to government programs such as public education and health care.\textsuperscript{153} While Mapuche women have made considerable efforts "to add their distinctive indigenous voice to official venues that represent Chilean women's concerns," such as SERNAM, many Mapuche women are disappointed at the lack of state recognition of the distinct discrimination they face and have advocated for their rights as indigenous women largely within the context of the Mapuche rights movement rather than the women's rights movement in Chile.\textsuperscript{154}

The twenty-first century governments of Chile and Peru must now undertake the task of incorporating sectors of their populations who have been marginalized by exclusive national imaginings so that indigenous women can exercise their human rights. In Peru, some progress has been made towards the inclusion of Quechua women into conceptions of the nation. The election of Quechua women's rights leaders María Sumire and Hilaria Supa to the Peruvian Congress in 2006 illustrates the way in which the state is beginning to reflect national expansion and serves an important step towards expanding Quechua representation in politics.\textsuperscript{155} However, Congresswomen Sumire and Supa have encountered significant obstacles since their election because they do not conform to hegemonic notions of who belongs to the Peruvian nation. When Sumire and Supa began their terms in Congress, they asked for a translator to be present during congressional sessions so that they could give testimony in Quechua, their native language.

\textsuperscript{153} Richards, "Bravas, Permitidas, Obsoletas," 556.
\textsuperscript{155} Oliart, 304.
Patricia Oliart describes the responses to this request: "This legitimate claim was blaringly opposed and even mocked by some members of Congress, and quickly ridiculed by comedians and cartoonists in the media, with no sanctions or official criticism to the initial reaction of the unsympathetic congress members."\(^{156}\) Although interpreters were eventually appointed, there was no apology for or acknowledgement on the part of government officials of the fact that there were no Quechua translators present in Congress prior to their requests.\(^ {157}\) Despite the nationalistic reactions they have encountered, Sumire and Supa have worked throughout their terms to incorporate indigenous women into state policies in Peru. Congresswoman Supa, who became the chair of the congressional education committee in 2010, has been a vocal advocate for increasing Quechua women's and girl's access to the country's public education system. Although some other members of congress have expressed their opposition to Supa's chairing of the education committee because of her own lack of formal education, Supa has responded that the exclusion she has experienced from Peru's formal education system as an indigenous woman make her well-qualified to hold this position.\(^ {158}\)

The public education system is one critical area in which Quechua women continue to be negatively affected by sentiments of nationalism in Peru. Quechua women and girls who attend the public schools are often ridiculed and humiliated by their teachers for being there, which causes many indigenous girls to drop out of school at a young age.\(^ {159}\) Despite the Peruvian government's efforts to establish intercultural schools with bilingual programs in the Andean regions of the country specifically for Quechua students, the Quechua girls are not treated the same as their male peers by teachers and school administration and are often viewed as

\(^{156}\) Oliart, 304.  
\(^{157}\) Ibid.  
\(^{159}\) Boesten, 86.
subservient. María Elena García illustrates this in her assessment of Quechua access to education, explaining that Quechua girls in these intercultural schools "are often expected to help with lunch, and can begin to eat only after the boys have been served."\textsuperscript{160} The indigenous women's rights movement has made inclusion in the public education system one of its central priorities, as it is a major way in which they experience state-sanctioned discrimination. In a country where 96% of men and 89% of women are literate, 31% of Quechua-speaking women are illiterate. Of the women living in Quechua communities, "38% have some years of primary schooling, 23% have made it to secondary school, and just under 3% have gone on to university."\textsuperscript{161} This issue has been an important area of focus for Quechua women's rights activists such as Hilaria Supa, who are working to expand the state's education system to include this sector of the population and change nationalistic perceptions of indigenous women. Both the Peruvian and Chilean governments must reject hegemonic forms of nationalism so that indigenous women living in these two countries can access their economic, social, and cultural rights as well as their civil and political rights.

The indigenous rights movements that have developed in Peru and Chile have both sought to combat discrimination, but their strategies and ways of interacting with their respective state governments have been markedly different. The smaller Mapuche population, which is concentrated in the southern part of Chile, has responded to the relegation it has faced in the Chilean national discourse by creating its own imagined "Mapuche nation." Some Mapuche activists who have been affected by sentiments of Mapuche nationalism contend that rather than working with the Chilean state to reflect a more inclusive conception of the nation, the Mapuche should seek to gain control of an autonomous territory because their appeals for inclusion by the

\textsuperscript{160} García, 102.
\textsuperscript{161} Paez, "Quechua Congresswoman Fights Discrimination."
Chilean state have not been successful.\textsuperscript{162} The massive earthquake of February 2010 that was centered in the south of Chile illustrates the continuance of the Chilean state's exclusive policies that have inspired the Mapuche autonomy efforts. While many Mapuche communities in the rural south were devastated by the earthquake, the Chilean government's emergency and reconstruction efforts in these communities were largely inadequate in comparison to its initiatives in other affected areas. Because the Chilean state excluded the Mapuche from its earthquake responses, Mapuche organizations were forced to seek aid from the international community.\textsuperscript{163} More research should be conducted in this region to uncover the effects of the Chilean government's selective reconstruction policies on women in Mapuche communities.

In Peru, where an estimated 45\% of the population identifies as indigenous, the rights movement that has arisen has sought Quechua inclusion into the existing national dialogue rather than retracting to construct their own separate national community.\textsuperscript{164} Oliart discusses this in her assessment of efforts to promote indigenous women's rights in Peru: "indigenous movements have not politicized their identity to achieve or negotiate their demands, but rather have chosen to affirm their belonging to the Peruvian nation using the existing legal frame to assert the justices of their causes."\textsuperscript{165} Despite their differences, though, the indigenous rights movements in both countries are a response to the fact that exclusive imaginings of the nation have restricted these peoples' abilities to access their rights as citizens of the states in which they live. The national discourses that have been constructed in Chile and Peru have greatly contributed to the marginalization of indigenous women. It is essential that the governments of these two countries

\textsuperscript{164} Salazar.
\textsuperscript{165} Oliart, 292.
acknowledge that although these women are often not considered to be part of the national community, they are citizens of the state and must have access to their rights as such.

**Conclusion: Indigenous women and the challenge of expanding national identities**

As I have illustrated in this paper, indigenous women in Chile and Peru have been negatively affected by the gendered, racialized national discourses that have been constructed by political elites. The governments of both Chile and Peru have been influenced by sentiments of nationalism throughout their histories and continue to reflect exclusive national imaginings in their contemporary policies and practices. Although these states have the responsibility to ensure that those living within their borders can access their full rights as citizens, hegemonic notions of who belongs to the nation often contribute to the restriction of the rights of Quechua and Mapuche women. Indigenous women are left out of the national imaginings of the elite not only because of their ethnicity, but also because of their gender and low socio-economic position.

Ernest Gellner describes nationalism as the political notion that the nation and the state should become one.\(^{166}\) Because Mapuche women have not been included in the imagined community of the Chilean nation, they have also been marginalized by the Chilean state, which has executed nationalist policies since its inception. While government agencies such as CONADI and SERNAM have served as steps towards inclusion, Mapuche women are still excluded from the Chilean national community today. It is clear that something needs to be done in order to secure equal rights for Mapuche women, but the question of what to do remains. Is it possible to expand the national discourse in Chile to include Mapuche women? Should Mapuche women's rights activists focus their efforts on securing an autonomous Mapuche state that

\(^{166}\) Gellner, 1.
reflects a Mapuche national identity, or work with the Chilean state in order to address their concerns? Until a change occurs, Mapuche women will continue to face "triple discrimination" and be negatively affected by the exclusive and hegemonic imaginings of the Chilean nation.

Despite the significant percentage of the Peruvian population that identifies as indigenous, Quechua women, like Mapuche women, have experienced marginalization through the modern history of Peru because they are not perceived as belonging to the exclusive national community. Quechua women's rights activists such as Hilaria Supa have sought to work with the Peruvian government to address the way in which nationalistic state policies and practices often overlook indigenous women. In order for Quechua women to be able to exercise their rights, the Peruvian state must reject exclusive forms of nationalism, offer reparations for the unjust policies of the past, such as the forced sterilization campaign of the late 1990s, and make a commitment to increasing Quechua women and girls' access to state programs such as public education. The fact that those who executed the forced sterilization campaign have yet to be brought to justice in Peru, in spite of the assertions of the IACHR and the monitoring committee of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination that this operation constituted a crime against humanity, demonstrates the discrimination that Quechua women continue to face in the twenty-first century. Throughout this paper, I have demonstrated the way in which notions of gender, race, and class have played a critical role in the national discourses that have been created in Andean South America and the discrimination that Quechua and Mapuche women have experienced as a result of their exclusion from the Peruvian and Chilean national communities. These two governments must now confront the challenge of including indigenous women who

167 Richards, “Expanding, Women's Citizenship?” 50.
have not been considered to be part of the nation in their policies, programs, and services so that these women can fully access their human rights. The extent to which indigenous women have been marginalized throughout history requires a concentrated effort on the part of the states of Chile and Peru to reject hegemonic forms of nationalism and instead reflect an expanded, multicultural, and gender-inclusive understanding of the nation.
Works Cited


